

Exhibit 4

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

BLACK LOVE RESISTS IN THE RUST, et al.

Plaintiffs,

-vs-

CITY OF BUFFALO, et al.

Defendants.

ANSWER to SUPPLEMENTAL
and AMENDED COMPLAINT

Civil Action No.: 18-cv-719

DEFENDANTS DEMAND
TRIAL BY JURY

Defendants, by and through their attorney Timothy A. Ball, Esq., Corporation Counsel for the City of Buffalo, as and for their Answer to the Plaintiffs' Supplemental and Amended Complaint in the above action, allege as follows, upon information and belief:

1. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph "1".
2. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "2", deny the Defendants engaged in any unlawful or discriminatory traffic enforcement practices. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.
3. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "3", admit that "traffic safety stops" have been conducted by the "Strike Force". Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

4. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “4”, admit that the Defendants do attempt to deter criminal activity, but deny that any unlawful searches or restrictions on liberty have occurred. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

5. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “5”.

6. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “6”, deny that the BPD enforces traffic laws in a discriminatory manner. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

7. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “7”, deny that the City has “deployed vehicle Checkpoints and racially discriminatory ticketing practices to generate revenue” and deny that any “Checkpoints” were conducted in a constitutionally impermissible manner or for a constitutionally impermissible purpose. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

8. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “8”, deny that the City has issued tickets unlawfully or for unlawful bases. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

9. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “9”, deny that the City has a “practice of targeting poor neighborhoods of color”. Deny knowledge or information

sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

10. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “10”.

11. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “11”.

12. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “12”.

13. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “13”, deny that the Defendants have engaged in any discriminatory or unconstitutional policing practices. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

14. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “14”.

15. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “15”.

16. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “16”.

17. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “17”.

18. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “18”.

19. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "19".

20. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "20".

21. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "21".

22. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "22".

23. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "23", admit that the City is a municipality in the State of New York that can sue and be sued, and that the City has and is authorized to maintain a police department engaged in law enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

24. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "24", admit that Byron W. Brown is the Mayor of the City of Buffalo. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

25. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "25", admit that Byron Lockwood is a City of Buffalo employee and has served as a Deputy Commissioner and acting Commissioner of the Buffalo Police Department ("BPD") and is the current Commissioner of the BPD. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

26. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “26”, admit that Daniel Derenda was the Commissioner of the BPD from approximately 2010 to January of 2018. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

27. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “27”, admit that Defendant Aaron Young has served as Chief of the BPD Housing Unit and Strike Force. Deny that Defendant Young “oversaw the unconstitutional conduct of BPD personnel operating each checkpoint”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

28. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “28”, admit that Defendant Kevin Brinkworth has served as a Lieutenant and as Chief of the Housing Unit with the BPD. Deny that Defendant Brinkworth “oversaw the unconstitutional conduct of BPD personnel operating each checkpoint”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

29. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “29”, admit that Defendant Philip Serafini was a Captain within the BPD Housing Unit and a City employee. Deny that any “Checkpoints and ticketing” were “conducted in an unconstitutional manner by Housing Unit officers and personnel”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

30. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “30”, admit that Defendant Robbin Thomas is a City employee and a police officer in the BPD. Deny knowledge or

information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

31. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "31".

32. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "32".

33. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "33".

34. Deny the allegations in paragraph "34".

35. With respect to the allegations in paragraph "35", admit the creation and existence of the Strike Force, and that its targets included the reduction of illegal gun, drug, and gang activity in high crime areas. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

36. Deny the allegations in paragraph "36".

37. Deny the allegations in paragraph "37".

38. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "38".

39. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "39".

40. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph "40".

41. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “41”.

42. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “42”.

43. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “43”.

44. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “44”, admit that a written directive has been promulgated, deny that the “directive omits key information necessary to guide officers’ discretion”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

45. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “45”.

46. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “46”.

47. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “47”.

48. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “48”.

49. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “49”.

50. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “50”.

51. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “51”.

52. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “52”.

53. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “53”.

54. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “54”.

55. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “55”.

56. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “56”.

57. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “57”.

58. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “58”.

59. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “59”.

60. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “60”, refers to the Supreme Court’s decision and all other applicable court decisions for the full extent and meaning

of the state of the law. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

61. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “61”.

62. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “62”.

63. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “63”.

64. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “64”, deny that the referenced article is an “example” of the proposition stated in the previous paragraph and refers to the article for the full extent of what was “reported”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

65. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “65”, admit that the words “high visibility, high saturation” and “daily roadblocks” were stated by Defendant Derenda. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

66. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “66”.

67. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “67”.

68. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “68”.

69. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “69”.

70. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “70”.

71. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “71”.

72. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “72”.

73. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “73”.

74. Admit the allegations in paragraph “74”.

75. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “75”.

76. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “76”.

77. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “77”.

78. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “78”.

79. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “79”.

80. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “80”.

81. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “81”.

82. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “82”.

83. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “83”, deny that “Black or Latino population” is a “highly significant driver of Checkpoint location”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

84. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “84”.

85. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “85”.

86. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “86”.

87. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “87”.

88. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “88”.

89. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “89”.

90. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “90”.

91. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “91”.

92. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “92”.

93. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “93”.

94. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “94”.

95. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “95”.

96. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “96”.

97. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “97”.

98. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “98”.

99. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “99”.

100. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “100”.

101. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “101”.

102. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “102”.

103. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “103”.

104. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “104”.

105. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “105”.

106. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “106”.

107. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “107”.

108. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “108”.

109. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “109”.

110. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “110”.

111. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “111”.
112. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “112”.
113. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “113”.
114. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “114”.
115. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “115”.
116. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “116”.
117. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “117”.
118. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “118”.
119. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “119”.
120. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “120”.
121. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “121”.
122. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “122”.

123. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “123”.

124. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “124”.

125. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “125”.

126. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “126”.

127. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “127”.

128. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “128”.

129. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “129”.

130. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “130”.

131. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “131”.

132. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “132”.

133. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “133”.

134. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “134”.

135. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “135”.

136. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “136”.

137. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “137”.

138. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “138”, admit that the New York State Department of Motor Vehicles has previously handled the adjudication of traffic violations issued in the City of Buffalo at certain times. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

139. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “139”.

140. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “140”, admit the establishment of the Buffalo Traffic Violations Agency. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations.

141. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “141”, admit that Councilmember Smith did state “it’s a win-win for not only the residents, but also the city, because the city also has the opportunity now to keep home some of the dollars from the traffic infractions”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations.

142. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “142”.

143. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “143”, admit that the BTVA was created by §6-24 of the Buffalo City Charter and refers to the provisions therein in response to the allegations contained herein. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

144. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “144”, admit that the Executive Director of the BTVA is appointed by the Mayor, but note that the appointment is subject to the confirmation of the Buffalo Common Council, and refers to the cited Charter and Code §6-24. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

145. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “145”.

146. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “146”.

147. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “147”.

148. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “148”.

149. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “149”.

150. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “150”.

151. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “151”.

152. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “152”.

153. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “153”.

154. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “154”.

155. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “155”.

156. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “156”.

157. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “157”.

158. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “158”.

159. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “159”.

160. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “160”.

161. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “161”.

162. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “162”.

163. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “163”.

164. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “164”, admit that the City of Buffalo Common Council passed an amendment to the municipal fee schedule in Chapter 175 of the Buffalo Municipal Code. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

165. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “165”, admit that amendments were made to the municipal fee schedule in Chapter 175 and refers to those amendments

and the sections of Buffalo Municipal Code. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

166. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “166”.

167. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “167”, admit that Councilmember Scanlon indicated that the legislation was enacted to “bring things in line with other municipalities”. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

168. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “168”.

169. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “169”.

170. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “170” and refers to any recordings for what was said as well as the meaning, intent, and context of any communications.

171. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “171”.

172. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “172”.

173. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “173”.

174. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “174”.

175. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “175”, admits the existence of a 2016 report by the Greater Buffalo Racial Equity Roundtable. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

176. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “176”.

177. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “177”.

178. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “178”.

179. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “179”.

180. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “180”, admit that the City of Buffalo Common Council adopted a resolution. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

181. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “181”.

182. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “182”, admit that the City of Buffalo Police Department has used a “Traffic Safety Checkpoint Tally Sheet” and refers to the document(s) for the information that is recorded thereon. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

183. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “183”.

184. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “184”.

185. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “185”.

186. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “186”.

187. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “187”.

188. Admit the allegations contained in paragraph “188”.

189. Admit the allegations contained in paragraph “189”.

190. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “190”, deny that any violations are raised or valid claims brought in this lawsuit. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

191. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “191”.

192. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “192”.

193. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “193”.

194. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “194”.

195. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “195”.

196. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “196”.

197. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “197”.

198. Deny the allegations in paragraph “198”.

199. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “199”.

200. Deny the allegations in paragraph “200”.

201. Deny the allegations in paragraph “201”.

202. Deny the allegations in paragraph “202”.

203. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “203”.

204. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “204”.

205. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “205”.

206. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “206”.

207. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “207”.

208. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “208”.

209. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “209”.

210. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “210”.

211. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “211”.

212. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “212”.

213. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “213”.

214. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “214”.

215. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “215”.

216. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “216”.

217. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “217”.

218. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “218”.

219. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “219”.

220. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “220”.

221. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “221”.

222. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “222”.

223. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “223”.

224. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “224”.

225. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “225”.

226. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “226”.

227. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “227”.

228. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “228”.

229. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “229”.

230. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “230”.

231. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “231”.

232. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “232”.

233. Admit the allegations contained in paragraph “233”.

234. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “234”, deny that the Defendants engage in discriminatory traffic enforcement in order to harvest revenue. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

235. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “235”.

236. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “236”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

237. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “237”.

238. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “238”.

239. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “239”.

240. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “240”.

241. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “241”.

242. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “242”.

243. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “243”.

244. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “244”.

245. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “245”.

246. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “246”.

247. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “247”.

248. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “248”.

249. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “249”.

250. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “250”.

251. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “251”.

252. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “252”.

253. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “253”.

254. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “254”.

255. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “255”.

256. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “256”.

257. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “257”.

258. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “258”.

259. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “259”.

260. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “260”.

261. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “261”.

262. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “262”.

263. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “263”.

264. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “264”.

265. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “265”.

266. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “266”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph

267. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “267”.

268. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “268”.

269. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “269”.

270. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “270”.

271. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “271”.

272. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “272”.

273. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “273”.

274. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “274”.

275. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “275”.

276. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “276”.

277. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “277”.

278. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “278”.

279. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “279”.

280. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “280”.

281. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “281”.

282. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “282”.

283. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “283”.

284. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “284”.

285. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “285”.

286. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “286”.

287. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “287”.

288. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “288”.

289. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “289”.

290. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “290”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in

291. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “291”.

292. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “292”.

293. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “293”.

294. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “294”.

295. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “295”.

296. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “296”.

297. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “297”.

298. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “298”.

299. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “299”.

300. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “300”.

301. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “301”.

302. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “302”.

303. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “303”.

304. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “304”.

305. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “305”.

306. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “306”.

307. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “307”.

308. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “308”.

309. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “309”.

310. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “310”.

311. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “311”.

312. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “312”.

313. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “313”.

314. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “314”.

315. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “315”.

316. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “316”.

317. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “317”.

318. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “318”.

319. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “319”.

320. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “320”.

321. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “321”.

322. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “322”.

323. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “323”.

324. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “324”.

325. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “325”.

326. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “326”.

327. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “327”.

328. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “328”.

329. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “329”.

330. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “330”.

331. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “331”.

332. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “332”.

333. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “333”.

334. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “334”.

335. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “335”.

336. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “336”.

337. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “337”.

338. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “338”.

339. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “339”.

340. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “340”.

341. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “341”.

342. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “342”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

343. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “343”.

344. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “344”.

345. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “345”.

346. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “346”.

347. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “347”.

348. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “348”.

349. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “349”.

350. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “350”.

351. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “351”.

352. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “352”.

353. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “353”.

354. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “354”.

355. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “355”.

356. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “356”.

357. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “357”.

358. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “358”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

359. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “359”.

360. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “360”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

361. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “361”.

362. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “362”.

363. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “363”.

364. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “364”.

365. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “365”.

366. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “366”.

367. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “367”.

368. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “368”.

369. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “369”.

370. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “370”.

371. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “371”.

372. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “372”.

373. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “373”.

374. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “374”.

375. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “375”.

376. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “376”.

377. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “377”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

378. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “378”.

379. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “379”.

380. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “380”.

381. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “381”.

382. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “382”.

383. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “383”.

384. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “384”.

385. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “385”.

386. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “386”.

387. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “387”.

388. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “388”.

389. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “389”.

390. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “390”.

391. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “391”.

392. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “392”.

393. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “393”.

394. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “394”.

395. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “395”.

396. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “396”.

397. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “397”, the Defendants deny engaging in any unconstitutional traffic enforcement. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

398. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “398”.

399. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “399”.

400. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “400”.

401. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “401”.

402. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “402”.

403. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “403”.

404. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “404”.

405. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “405”.

406. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “406”.

407. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “407”.

408. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “408”.

409. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “409”.

410. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “410”.

411. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “411”.

412. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “412”.

413. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “413”.

414. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “414”.

415. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “415”.

416. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “416”.

417. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “417”.

418. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “418”.

419. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “419”.

420. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “420”.

421. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “421”.

422. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “422”.

423. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “423”.

424. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “424”.

425. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “425”.

426. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “426”.

427. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “427”.

428. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “428”.

429. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “429”.

430. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “430”.

431. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “431”.

432. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “432”.

433. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “433”.

434. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “434”.

435. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “435”.

436. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “436”.

437. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “427”.

438. With respect to the allegations in paragraph “438”, deny that the Defendants have or will violate any constitutional rights of the Plaintiffs. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations in said paragraph.

439. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “439”.

440. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “440”.

441. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “441”.

442. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “442”.

443. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “443”.

444. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “444”.

445. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “445”.

446. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “446”.

447. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “447”.

448. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “448”.

449. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “449”.

450. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “450”.

451. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “451”.

452. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations contained in paragraph “452”.

453. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “453”.

454. Deny the allegations contained in paragraph “454”.

GENERAL DENIAL

Deny each and every allegation of the Complaint not hereinbefore specifically admitted, denied or otherwise controverted.

AS AND FOR A FIRST DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Complaint fails to state a cause of action against the Defendants, in whole or in part.

AS AND FOR A SECOND DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Complaint is barred, in whole or in part, on the grounds that the actions of the Defendants did not violate the any Constitutional rights, privileges, or immunities, of the Plaintiffs or class members.

AS AND FOR A THIRD DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Complaint is barred, in whole or in part, upon the doctrine of legislative and/or prosecutorial immunity.

AS AND FOR A FOURTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Complaint is barred, in whole or in part, upon the doctrine of qualified immunity.

AS AND FOR A FIFTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Complaint is barred, in whole or in part, upon the grounds of any sovereign, governmental, or qualified immunity available to municipalities in tort actions in the State of New York.

AS AND FOR A SIXTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, and without admitting that the Complaint states a claim, any remedies are limited to the extent that there is sought an overlapping or duplicative recovery pursuant to the various claims against the Defendants or others for any alleged single wrong.

AS AND FOR A SEVENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, Plaintiffs' claims are barred by the doctrine of laches, in that Plaintiffs and class members unreasonably delayed efforts to enforce their rights, if any, despite full awareness of the Defendants' actions.

AS AND FOR AN EIGHTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, one or more of Plaintiffs' and class members claims are time barred by the applicable Statutes of Limitations.

AS AND FOR A NINTH DEFENSE:

Any and all actions were carried out for legitimate and lawful reasons and not motivated or caused by the reckless disregard for the constitutional rights of the Plaintiffs or the class members.

AS AND FOR A TENTH DEFENSE:

Under relevant state and federal law, punitive damages cannot be awarded against the Defendants.

AS AND FOR AN ELEVENTH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members' claims may be barred, in whole or in part, by their failure to exhaust available administrative remedies and/or comply with conditions precedent to suit.

AS AND FOR A TWELFTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, Plaintiffs claims may be barred by the doctrines of collateral estoppel and/or res judicata.

AS AND FOR A THIRTEENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, Plaintiffs and class members do not meet the requirements for class certification under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23.

AS AND FOR A FOURTEENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, Plaintiffs and class members may lack standing to assert one or more of the claims alleged in the Complaint.

AS AND FOR A FIFTEENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, Plaintiffs and class-members may have failed to mitigate their damages, if any.

AS AND FOR A SIXTEENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, any stop, search, detention, or arrest was based on reasonable suspicion and/or probable cause.

AS AND FOR A SEVENEENTH DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the acts or omissions were within the lawful of authority of the laws and Constitution of New York State and United States.

AS AND FOR AN EIGHTEENTH DEFENSE:

Any and all actions were carried out for legitimate and lawful reasons and not motivated by malice or discrimination.

AS AND FOR A NINETEENTH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members' claims may be barred, in whole or in part, by the lack of "purposeful" discrimination.

AS AND FOR A TWENTIETH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members' claims may be barred, in whole or in part, on the grounds that Defendants who did not receive any federal funds or programs cannot be sued for violation of Title VI of Civil Rights Act.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-FIRST DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members were not intended beneficiaries of any federally funded programs or activity receiving federal assistance.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-SECOND DEFENSE:

Any and all actions and omissions were carried out in a reasonable manner.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-THIRD DEFENSE:

Upon information and belief, the Plaintiffs failed to obtain jurisdiction over one or more of the Defendants.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-FOURTH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members' claims may be moot.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-FIFTH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members claims may not be ripe.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-SIXTH DEFENSE:

Plaintiffs and class members' claims may lack standing to seek injunctive relief.

AS AND FOR A TWENTY-SEVENTH DEFENSE:

The alleged actions, omissions or programs were designed to serve special needs.

WHEREFORE, the Defendants demand judgment dismissing the Plaintiffs' Complaint, denying the class certification, denying injunctive relief, together with the costs and disbursements of this Action, and for such other and further relief as to this Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: June 4, 2020
Buffalo, New York

TIMOTHY A. BALL, ESQ.
Corporation Counsel
Attorney for Defendants

/s/ Robert E. Quinn
By: Robert E. Quinn
Assistant Corporation Counsel
65 Niagara Square, 11th Floor
Buffalo, New York 14202
Tel.: (716) 851-4326
rquinn@city-buffalo.com